

Regional Approaches to Affordable Housing



Stuart Meck, Rebecca Retzlaff, and James Schwab



American Planning Association

Planning Advisory Service
Report Number 513/514

Stuart Meck, FAICP, is a Senior Research Fellow with the American Planning Association. From 1994 to 2001, he served as the principal investigator for the APA's Growing SmartSM project, a long-term effort to draft and implement the next generation of model planning and zoning legislation for the U.S. The project resulted in the publication in 2002 of the *Growing SmartSM Legislative Guidebook* and *User Manual*. Meck is coauthor, with Professor Kenneth Pearlman, AICP, of the Ohio State University graduate program in city and regional planning, of *Ohio Planning and Zoning Law*, 7th edition (West Group, 2002).

Rebecca Coleen Retzlaff is pursuing a Ph.D. in urban planning and policy at the University of Illinois at Chicago (UIC). She currently works at the UIC Great Cities Institute. She is a former senior planner with the City of Detroit Planning and Development Department, where she worked on brownfield redevelopment and environmental planning.

Jim Schwab, AICP, is a senior research associate with the American Planning Association and the co-editor of *Zoning News*. He was the principal investigator for PAS Report 483/484 on planning for disaster recovery and the author of PAS Report 482 on concentrated animal feeding operations and PAS Report 444 on industrial performance standards. He is also the author of two books, *Raising Less Corn and More Hell: Midwestern Farmers Speak Out* (University of Illinois Press, 1988) and *Deeper Shades of Green: The Rise of Blue Collar and Minority Environmentalism in America* (Sierra Club Books, 1994).

About This Study

The work that provided the basis for this publication was supported by funding under grants from the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) and the Fannie Mae Foundation. The substance and findings of the work are dedicated to the public. The author and publisher are solely responsible for the accuracy of the statements and interpretations contained in this publication. Such interpretations do not necessarily reflect the views of the government or the Fannie Mae Foundation. This report was prepared under HUD Cooperative Agreement No. H-21213CA.

This study is limited by publicly available information and data and their accuracy, and the views of those interviewed by the APA researchers; the authors are solely responsible for the accuracy of the statements and interpretations contained in this report. The authors attempted to focus on measurable outcomes of the programs themselves, whether they were actually resulting in the production of affordable housing (if such data were available), and did not try to second-guess the program design, structure, or political wisdom of the approaches, or the competence or judgment of those who were administering the programs. Still, the study does not endeavor to be a rigorous program-specific audit, as might be conducted by a federal or state agency. Nonetheless, in some places, it was not clear what the program outcomes were; sometimes the best data are not very good.

Regional Approaches to Affordable Housing is a research project and does not necessarily represent the policy of APA, unless specifically identified as such in a policy guide or other action by its Board of Directors.

Cover design by Lisa Barton; this report is printed on recyclable paper.

*Cover photo: Pine Manor affordable rental unit in Bethlehem, New Hampshire
(Source: Affordable Housing, Education, and Development (AHEAD))*

The Planning Advisory Service is a subscription service offered by the Research Department of the American Planning Association. Eight reports are produced each year. Subscribers also receive the PAS Memo each month and have use of the Inquiry Answering Service. W. Paul Farmer, Executive Director; Sylvia Lewis, Publications Director; William Klein, Director of Research.

Planning Advisory Service Reports are produced in the Research Department of APA. James Hecimovich, Editor; Lisa Barton, Design Associate; J.E. Luebering, Editorial Assistant; Toby Zallman, Design Assistant.

© February 2003 by the American Planning Association.

APA's publications office is at 122 S. Michigan Ave., Suite 1600, Chicago, IL 60603.

E-mail: pasreports@planning.org

APA headquarters office is at 1776 Massachusetts Ave., N.W., Washington, DC 20036.

Regional Approaches to Affordable Housing

STUART MECK, FAICP, REBECCA RETZLAFF,
AND JAMES SCHWAB, AICP

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	iii
Chapter 1. Affordable Housing as a Regional Planning Priority	1
About This Report	3
How This Study Was Conducted	5
Previous Studies on the Topic	5
Chapter 2. Historical Development of Regional Housing Planning in the U.S.	9
Statistical Studies of Housing Conditions	10
Federal Promotion of Local and Regional Housing Planning	12
Regional Fair-Share Housing Planning	13
Technical Manuals Supporting Regional Housing Planning	15
Chapter 3. The Big Issues	19
Defining Affordable Housing	20
The Regional Dimension of Affordable Housing	23
The Weakness of Regional Planning Authority	25
The “Chain of Exclusion”	26
The Nimby Problem	26
Chapter 4. Fair-Share Programs and an Incentive Program	31
New Jersey	32
California	42
Portland Metro, Oregon	68
New Hampshire	76
Metropolitan Council, Twin Cities Region, Minnesota	88
Chapter 5. Regional Housing Trust Funds	107
The Vermont Housing and Conservation Board	108
A Regional Coalition for Housing, King County, Washington	114
Sacramento, California, Housing and Redevelopment Agency	123
Columbus/Franklin County, Ohio, Affordable Housing Trust Fund	130
Montgomery County, Ohio, Housing Trust Fund	133
Chapter 6. State Affordable Housing Appeals Systems	141
Massachusetts Comprehensive Permit Law	142
The Rhode Island Low- and Moderate-Income Housing Act	147
The Connecticut Affordable Housing Appeals Procedure	152

Chapter 7. Private-Sector and Other Initiatives	159
Bay Area Council, San Francisco Region, California	160
Metropolis 2020, Chicago	164
Maryland’s Live Near Your Work Program	170
City of Ames and Story County, Iowa, Partnership	173
Affordable Housing, Education and Development Inc. (AHEAD)	
Northern Grafton and Coos Counties, New Hampshire	179
Twin Pines Housing Trust, Upper Valley Region,	
New Hampshire and Vermont	182
Chapter 8. Concluding Thoughts on a Model Program for	
 Regional Approaches to Affordable Housing	187
Some Second-Best Approaches	188
A Program of Best Practices and Strategies	189
Appendices	199
Appendix A. Partially Annotated List of References	
and Staff Research Contact List	199
Appendix B. List of State Statutes on Local Housing Planning	229
Appendix C. Participants in APA Regional Planning	
for Affordable Housing Symposim	233
Appendix D. A Bibliographic Research Note	
on Housing Forecasting and Fair-Share Allocation Formulas	235
Appendix E. Excerpts from APA Growing Smart SM	
Legislative Guidebook	241
Appendix F. Contact List	269
Appendix G. The American Planning Association	
Policy Guide on Housing (excerpt)	271

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to express their appreciation to all of the individuals and organizations that provided information for the preparation of this Planning Advisory Service report, and to the project sponsors, the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) and the Fannie Mae Foundation. In particular, we would like to thank our two project officers in HUD's Office of Policy Development and Research, Edwin A. Stromberg and Dale E. Thomson, now with Wayne State University in Detroit, and Jamie L. Holtzclaw, Stephanie A. Jennings, AICP, and Kris Rengert at the Fannie Mae Foundation. Marya Morris, AICP, senior research associate at APA, contributed to the research design of the project. John Bredin, Esq, a former research fellow at APA and now a practicing attorney in Chicago, assisted in legal research for the project and the completion of an initial draft of chapter 2 of this report.

The project got off to a good start in with the enthusiastic help of all of the participants of the symposium on regional affordable housing held at the APA offices in Chicago on October 29-30, 2000: Alex Amoroso, AICP, Association of Bay Area Governments; Professor William Baer, University of Southern California; Caren Dewar, Metropolitan Council; Tasha Harmon, AICP, affordable housing activist in Portland, Oregon; Thomas Kemper, builder/developer in Portland Oregon; Roberta Longfellow, AICP, Montgomery County Community and Economic Development Department; Professor Rolf Pendall, AICP, Cornell University; Peter Reinhart, Hovnanian Builders; Jennifer Twombly, National Low Income Housing Coalition; symposium facilitator Joseph Whorton, Georgia Rural Development Council; and project officers, Dale E. Thomson, HUD, and Stephanie Jennings, Fannie Mae Foundation.

The following people responded graciously and generously to the authors by providing interviews, loaning photographs, and reviewing report drafts: Ray Brewster, Twin Pines Housing Trust; James Cordingley and Sean Thompson, New Jersey Council on Affordable Housing; Nancy Firfer, Metropolis 2020; Professor Sharon Perlman Krefetz, Clark University; Nan Merritt, Columbus and Franklin County Affordable Housing Trust; Joan Friedman, Association of Bay Area Governments; Andrew Michael, Bay Area Council; Arthur Sullivan, A Regional Coalition for Housing (ARCH); Paul Carlson, ARCH Citizens Advisory Board; Richard Conrad, City of Mercer Island; Terry Shirk, AICP, City of Redmond, Washington; David Wood, Affordable Housing, Education, and Development; Beverly Fretz-Brown, Sacramento Housing and Redevelopment Agency; Brian O'Connell, AICP, and Vanessa Baker-Latimer, City of Ames, Iowa Department of Planning and Housing; Linda Wheaton, Karen Westmont, and Robert Maus, California Department of Housing and Community Development; John Papagni and Mitra Basu, Maryland Department of Housing and Community Development; Jacob Lieb, Southern California Association of Governments; Susan Baldwin, AICP, San Diego Association of Governments; Polly Nichol, Paul Hannan, Larry Mires, and David Weinstein, Vermont Housing and Conservation Board; Gerry Uba and Rex Burkholder, Metro Council, Portland, Oregon; Allan Mallach, AICP / PP, a New Jersey planning consultant; Werner Lohe, Massachusetts Affordable Housing Appeals Committee; Derry Riding, Rhode Island Statewide Program; Judy Jones, Rhode Island Housing and Mortgage Finance Corporation; Professor Terry Tondro, University of Connecticut School of Law; Dave Bennett, Metropolitan Mayors Caucus; Theresa Huntsinger, Coalition for a Livable Future; Steve Krohn, Real Estate Analytics; Steve Torsell, Homes on the Hill Community Development Corporation; Bruce Mayberry, planning consultant in Yarmouth, Maine; Jeffrey R. Hayes, AICP, North Country Council; Ben Frost, New Hampshire Office of Planning; Ed Stretch, Gilman Housing Trust; Ed Sullivan, land-use attorney with Garvey Schubert & Barer in Portland, Oregon; Brenda Torpy, Burlington Community Land Trust; Adam Zoger, Pacific Coast Capital Partners; Matthew Walsh and Laura Scott, Central New Hampshire Regional Planning Commission; William Ray, New Hampshire Housing Finance Authority; Professor William Morrish, University of Virginia School of Architecture; Joy Sorenson Navarre, Metropolitan Interfaith Council on Affordable Housing; Guy Peterson, Metropolitan Council; Mayor Karen Anderson, City of Minnetonka, Minnesota; and Steve Heuchert, Nashua Regional Planning Commission.

Additional photographs and information for the report were provided by Shannon Taylor and Brad White, LR Development Company, LLC; Jason Wittenberg, Minneapolis Planning Department; Rebecca Davis, San Diego Association of Governments; and Deb Wenig, County Corp.

*Stuart Meck, FAICP
Rebecca C. Retzlaff
James C. Schwab, AICP*

*December 31, 2002
Chicago, Illinois*